

SGIM Regional Peer Review Rubics

Clinical Vignettes Scientific Abstracts Innovations Workshops

Thank you for volunteering to peer review submissions for the Annual Meeting. Your thoughtful review and scoring will ensure SGIM provides quality peer-reviewed content at the Regional Meeting. You should use the following rubrics to guide your scoring.

^{**}Prior to starting this evaluation please take a moment to consider the intent of this activity and refrain from basing answers on personal attributes or other factors that would result in biased scores. Gender and race bias is a serious issue and one that is often evident on evaluations. Your scores and suggestions should be on the technical aspects of the presentation.**

CLINICAL VIGNETTE PEER REVIEW RUBRIC



Important Clinical Problem To what extent does the abstract illustrate an important clinical problem(s) commonly encountered by internists, such as diagnostic, therapeutic, or management dilemma?

Illustrate an mportant clinical problem(s) of or oblem(s) to general internists are all i	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Clinical practice, education or research in either outpatient or hospital settings? 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Provides no Provides a little Insight into Provides adequate insight considerable significant complete	Ilustrate an mportant clinical problem(s) to	clinical problem(s) of little importance to general	clinical problem(s) of some importance to general	important clinical problem(s) of average importance to	important clinical problem(s) of moderate importance to	important clinical problem(s) of significant importance to	problem(s) of extreme importance to
Provides no Provides a little Provides some Provides Significant Complete	Insight into Clinical Practice, Education or Research To what extent does the abstract provide insight into clinical practice, education or research in either outpatient or hospital settings?						
insight into insight into insight into adequate insight considerable significant complete		•	earch in either ou		al settings?	·	insignt into
	clinical practice, 1	education or rese	earch in either ou	tpatient or hospite	al settings? 5	6	7
clinical practice, clinical practice, clinical practice, into clinical insight into insight into insight into	clinical practice, 1 Provides no	education or rese	3 Provides some	tpatient or hospito 4 Provides	al settings? 5 Provides	6 Provides	7 Provides

Relevance to General Internal Medicine To what extent does the abstract offer a diagnosis, physical examination or management pearl that is important to general internists?

practice,

research

education or

clinical practice,

education or

research

clinical practice,

education or

research

clinical practice,

education or

research

education or

research

education or

research

education or

research

2	3	4	5	6	7
mportant to	Important to	Important to	Important to	Important to	Important to
only a few	some general	about half of	many general	many general	most all general
general internists	internists	general internists	internists	internists and	internists and
				expands current	greatly expands
				concepts	current
					concepts
)	nly a few	nly a few some general	nly a few some general about half of	nly a few some general about half of many general	nly a few eneral internists some general internists about half of general internists internists internists and expands current

Discussion of Relevant Literature To what extent does the abstract include a discussion of relevant literature, as if submitting the vignette for peer-reviewed publication?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Provides no	Provides a little	Provides some	Provides	Provides above	Provides	Provides
discussion of	discussion of	discussion of	adequate	average	substantial	complete
relevant	relevant	relevant	discussion of	discussion of	discussion of	discussion of
literature	literature	literature	relevant	relevant	relevant	relevant
			literature	literature	literature	literature
_						

Quality of Writing Is the writing clear and organized to effectively communicate findings?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Writing is poor and disorganized	Writing is adequate and somewhat disorganized	Writing is adequate and minimally disorganized	Writing is clear and organized	Writing is above average and organized	Writing is high quality and well organized	Writing is outstanding quality and very well organized

SCIENTIFIC ABSTRACT PEER REVIEW RUBRIC



Importance of the Research Question: To what extent does the abstract address a topic that is <u>important</u>? To what degree will the results advance concepts in General Internal Medicine?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Does not address	Addresses a topic	Addresses a topic	Addresses a topic	Addresses a topic	Addresses a topic	Addresses a topic
a topic important	important to only	important to	important to	that is important	that is important	important to
to general	a <i>few</i> general	some general	about <i>half</i> of	to <i>many</i> general	to <i>most</i> general	nearly all general
internists.	internists.	internists.	general	internists; or	internists; or	internists; or
			internists.	somewhat	greatly expands	introduces a <i>new</i>
				expands current	current concepts.	concept.
				concepts.		

Strength and Appropriateness of Methods: Is the <u>study design</u> clearly described? Are <u>sampling</u> procedures adequately described, including inclusion and exclusion criteria; is there potential selection bias? Are the measures reliable and valid? Are possible <u>confounding</u> factors addressed? Are the <u>statistical analyses</u> appropriate for the study design, and are they the best that could have been used? Is there discussion of the statistical power?

[Please note that not all issues described apply to all abstract types. For example, qualitative studies may not have statistical analyses; however, they should still be evaluated on the quality of study design description and appropriateness of the methods.]

1	2	2	, <u>, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>	F	, <u>, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>	7
1	2	3	4	5	0	/
Study design and	Study design and	Study design and	Study design and	Study design and	Study design and	Study design and
sampling	sampling	sampling	sampling	sampling	sampling	sampling
procedures not	procedures	procedures	procedures <i>fully</i>	procedures fully	procedures <i>well</i>	procedures very
described.	poorly described.	adequately	described.	described. No	described. No	clearly described.
Possible	Possible	described.	Measures are	selection bias	selection bias	No selection bias
confounders not	confounders not	Possible	probably reliable	exists. Measures	exists. Measures	exists. Measures
discussed.	discussed.	confounders not	and valid.	probably reliable	are reliable and	are reliable and
Statistical	Statistical	discussed.	Possible	and valid.	valid. Possible	valid. Possible
analyses are not	analyses are not	Statistical	confounders	Possible	confounders fully	confounders fully
discussed.	appropriate.	analyses are	partially	confounders fully	discussed and	discussed and
		adequate.	discussed, but	discussed and	controlled for as	controlled for as
			may not be	controlled for as	needed.	needed.
			controlled.	needed.	Statistical	Statistical
			Statistical	Statistical	analyses are	analyses are the
			analyses are	analyses are	strong.	best that could
			appropriate.	appropriate.		have been used.

Validity of Conclusions and Implications: Are <u>conclusions</u> clearly stated and justified by the data? Are <u>implications</u> strong enough to influence how clinicians/teachers/researchers "act" in clinical practice, teaching, or future research?

enough to influence how clinicians/teachers/researchers "act" in clinical practice, teaching, or future research?						
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Conclusions and	Conclusions	Conclusions	Conclusions	Conclusions	Conclusions	Conclusions
implications not	present but not	present and	clearly stated and	clearly stated and	clearly stated and	clearly stated and
included. Does	justified. Does	weakly	supported.	supported.	supported.	supported.
not influence	not influence	supported.	Absent or weak	Implications	Implications	Implications fully
action.	action.	Provides	implications.	weak. Provides	moderately	appropriate.
		knowledge but	Provides	knowledge that	appropriate.	Provides
		likely will not	knowledge but	may change	Provides	knowledge that
		change action.	likely will not	action.	knowledge that	likely will change
			change action.		may change	action.
					action.	
Quality of Writin	g: Is the <u>writing</u> cle	ar and organized to	effectively comm	unicate findings?		
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Writing is poor	Writing is	Writing is	Writing is <i>clear</i>	Writing is above	Writing is high	Writing is

and organized.

average and

organized.

quality and well

organized.

masterful and

well organized.

and disorganized.

adequate and

disorganized.

somewhat

adequate and

disorganized.

minimally

INNOVATIONS PEER REVIEW RUBRIC



Goals/Importance Is this topic clearly stated, important and relevant to the practice of GIM? Does it fill an unmet need, would implementation lead to an improvement for the target audience?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Rarely		Sometimes		Usually		Critically
relevant/important		relevant/importan		relevant/important to		relevant/
to GIM Practice		t to GIM		GIM Practice		important
						to GIM

Methods Is the intervention well described? Are teaching method(s) appropriate to meet defined objectives? Are assessment measures adequate to evaluate outcomes? For technology-enhanced innovations, is the technology appropriate for the objectives, implemented effectively, and user-friendly?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Unable to adequately determine methods		Methods are discernible		Methods are clear, appropriate for goals, adequate to attain evaluation		Methods use a gold standard or create one that can be replicated

Innovation Is this work truly innovative, i.e. do authors show that it is a novel concept, or an implementation not done elsewhere? Does it fill an unmet need?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Duplicates other		Some aspects of		Overall original concept		Strikingly
efforts/studies		approach are		approach, innovative or		novel
		original, others		unmet need		approach or
		duplicate other				innovation,
		efforts/studies				may fill gaps
						that may
						yet be
						unrealized
						in medical
						practice
						1

Impact Is it more than an adaptation to local needs? Is the innovation feasible elsewhere? Does the abstract convey how the innovation can be implemented? Is there reflection on lessons learned, and what may be valuable to others?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Unlikely to be useful/applicable beyond studied institution	_	Possibly of use to others, implementation might be feasible at other sites	-	Easily implementable and feasible to translate to other sites		Easy to adapt to other sites; high positive impact for
						invested resources

WORKSHOP PEER REVIEW RUBRIC



Learning Objectives	To what extent are the	loarning objectives of	early stated and measurable?
Learning Objectives	To what extent are the	learning objectives cl	early stated and measurable?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
The learning		The learning		The learning objectives		The learning
objectives and		objectives and		and presentation		objectives and
the presentation		presentation		proposal well aligned		presentation
proposal do not		proposal somewhat		and moderately		proposal clearly
align		aligned and not		measurable or		aligned, easily
		easily measurable		generalizable		applicable
		or				/generalizable and
		generalizable				have identified
						measurable
						outcomes

Method of Teaching To what extent do the method of teaching and outline of session match the stated learning objectives?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Not outlined		Outlined but the		Well outlined		Stimulates active
well		time allocation not		Practical and meaningful		audience interaction
		appropriate		demonstration of		Promotes immediate
				objectives		call to action.
						Practical and
						meaningful
						demonstration of
						objectives. Has
						collaboration across
						institutions

Likely to Engage How likely is this session to enhance clinical, research, or educational behaviors of the session attendees?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Not likely to		Somewhat likely to		Very likely to enhance		Definitely likely to
enhance all/or		enhance all/or		all/or either clinical,		enhance all/or either
either clinical,		either clinical,		research or educational		clinical, research or
research or		research or		behaviors with novel		educational
educational		educational		information		behaviors with novel
behaviors with		behaviors with				information
novel		novel information				
information						1

OPTIONAL: Relation to Meeting Theme - How closely does this submission relate to the meeting theme or SGIM strategic priorities?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Unrelated to		Somewhat related		Mostly related to theme		Directly related to
either		to meeting theme or strategic priorities		or strategic priorities		theme or strategic priorities