HOW TO BE A REVIEWER FOR HOSPITAL MEDICINE ARTICLES – THE SQUIRE GUIDELINES

• Ben Taylor, MD, MPH. The University of Alabama at Birmingham bbtaylor@uab.edu
• Amir Jaffer, MD. University of Miami. ajaffer@med.miami.edu
• William Southern, MD. Moses Division Hospital of Montefiore Medical Center. wsouther@montefiore.org
• Jean S. Kutner, MD, MSPH. University of Colorado Denver School of Medicine Jean.Kutner@ucdenver.edu
• Carlos Estrada, MD, MS. Birmingham VA National Quality Scholars Program, Birmingham VAMC, The University of Alabama at Birmingham (Carlos.Estrada@va.gov).

In conjunction with: Academic Hospitalist Taskforce

Summary
SHM Editors and a past JGIM Deputy Editor will highlight the benefits of participating as a journal reviewer and provide specific suggestions about how to become an effective reviewer. The interactive workshop will be helpful to prospective, new, and experienced reviewers (residents, fellows, and faculty are invited to participate). An effective review discusses the importance and originality of the study, identifies the strengths and weaknesses, provides specific and constructive suggestions supplying examples from the manuscript, and comments on the interpretation of the results. Discussants will focus on quality and safety studies using the Standards for Quality Improvement Reporting Excellence (SQUIRE) guidelines for publication of quality improvement articles http://squire-statement.org. We will provide an annotated list of journal venues and resources for hospitalists with an interest in quality and safety improvement.

Online Preliminary Program Summary:
Presenters will highlight the benefits of participating as a reviewer and provide specific suggestions about how to become an effective reviewer. The interactive workshop will be helpful to prospective, new, and experienced reviewers (residents, fellows, and faculty are invited to participate). An effective review discusses the importance and originality of the study, identifies the strengths and weaknesses, provides specific and constructive suggestions supplying examples from the manuscript, and comments on the interpretation of the results. Discussants will focus on quality and safety studies using the Standards for Quality Improvement Reporting Excellence (SQUIRE) guidelines for publication of quality improvement articles http://squire-statement.org. We will provide an annotated list of journal venues and resources for hospitalists with an interest in quality and safety improvement.

Learning Objectives:
(1) List features of an effective reviewer of hospital medicine manuscripts, (2) List strategies for preparing outstanding reviews, (3) Increase awareness of the SQUIRE guidelines.

Agenda:
• Introduction, Goals, and Objectives (5 min).
• Presentation. Overview of the review process, reviewer responsibilities, benefits, and characteristics of a good review. We will illustrate key points with a concise presentation (10 min).
• Small Group Exercise. Participants will work in small groups to identify the salient features of more and less effective reviews using samples from reviews of recent hospital medicine-related articles (30 min).
• Discussion and Summary. Groups will briefly present their main findings. Faculty will present the SQUIRE guidelines in parallel to emphasize specific areas while addressing questions from the audience (35 min)
• Conclusions. Participants will receive a list of journals to sign up to become a reviewer (5 min).
• Evaluation (5 min).
### What Do We Know About Reviews?

- **Quality of peer reviews vary widely**

- **Improves**
  - Precision of reporting, results, discussion, temper conclusions
  - Manuscript in general, abstract quality, readability, accuracy of references (technical editing)

- **Better quality reviews**
  - Younger, lower academic rank
  - Strong academic institutions
  - Previous research training
  - Postgraduate degrees
  - Known to the editors

- **No benefit:**
  - Blinding the review process
  - Training/ feedback to reviewers

### Why Should I Become a Reviewer?

**Sharpen your skills:**

- Quality/ safety is gaining MORE prominence
- Developing programs to DECREASE re-admissions is critical
- Documenting ROI (by measuring and reporting) will garner support

**Indicator of national prominence (promotion / advancement):**

- Can I get a (better) job?
Questions to think about:

- Is the paper a useful original contribution? (important? original?)
- Is the paper appropriate for the audience?
- Is the literature review current and does it place the study in appropriate context?
- Are there any ethical issues that need to be addressed?
- Are the methods and analysis valid and clear? strengths/ weaknesses?
- Are the tables and figures clear? Is there good use of space in the tables?
- Are the conclusions valid?
- Is the discussion insightful?
- Are the limitations discussed in enough detail?
- What are the relevance and implications of the findings?
- Is the writing clear and concise?

Do’s

- Prioritize and organize your concerns
- Be concise, specific and give examples from the manuscript
- Provide specific and constructive suggestions
- Be respectful of the authors
- Act as the expert
- Use guidelines or checklists as appropriate
- Follow the instructions, complete promptly
- Be frank when making confidential comments to the editor
- If confidential comment to Editor, convey same message
- Declare any potential conflicts of interest
- Treat the manuscript as a confidential document

Bottom Line!

- Ask a colleague: “If someone sends a manuscript your way, I’d like to help!”
- Submit an article to a QI/ safety Journal (see list)
- Sign-up to be a reviewer: [http://jgim.iusm.iu.edu/](http://jgim.iusm.iu.edu/)
References

SQUIRE Guidelines (Standards for QUality Improvement Reporting Excellence) Final revision – 4-29-08
http://squire-statement.org/assets/pdfs/SQUIRE_guidelines_table.pdf

Checklists

General Information

6. HOW TO BE AN OUTSTANDING REVIEWER FOR JGIM AND OTHER JOURNALS! http://www.sgim.org/userfiles/file/AMHandouts/AM06/handouts/WD07.pdf
### Venues for Safety and Quality Improvement Publications (Medline indexed)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal Title</th>
<th>Version</th>
<th>IF</th>
<th>Type papers</th>
<th>Fee</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>American journal of medical quality : <a href="http://ajm.sagepub.com/">http://ajm.sagepub.com/</a></td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>OR,E,C,P (3,500 words)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Focused in the resources, processes, and perspectives contributing to health care services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare benchmarks and quality improvement</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Health services research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation Science <a href="http://www.implementationscience.com/">http://www.implementationscience.com/</a></td>
<td>E</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>OR, R</td>
<td>$1,945</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International journal for health care quality assurance <a href="http://info.emeraldinsight.com/products/journals/journals.htm?PHPSESSID=m91hkpq0n28u0ot1f1v11230h0&amp;id=ijhca">http://info.emeraldinsight.com/products/journals/journals.htm?PHPSESSID=m91hkpq0n28u0ot1f1v11230h0&amp;id=ijhca</a></td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>OR,E,R,L,C (3,500-6000 words)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>QI, HSR, qualitative, quantitative studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Graduate Medical Education <a href="http://www.jgme.org/loi/jgme">http://www.jgme.org/loi/jgme</a></td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td></td>
<td>OR,R,L,C (3500 words)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Launched in 2009 by ACGME, calling for papers, focused in education, QI and education innovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of nursing administration <a href="http://journals.lww.com/onajournal/pages/default.aspx">http://journals.lww.com/onajournal/pages/default.aspx</a></td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>OR (3,600 words)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Content is geared to nurse leaders and managers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of nursing care quality <a href="http://journals.lww.com/jncqjournal/pages/default.aspx">http://journals.lww.com/jncqjournal/pages/default.aspx</a></td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td></td>
<td>OR,R,C (18pages)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Patient safety, leadership, QI, and the application of quality principles in the clinical setting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal for healthcare quality : <a href="http://www3.interscience.wiley.com/journal/122585946/group/home.html">http://www3.interscience.wiley.com/journal/122585946/group/home.html</a></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>OR,E,R,L,C (1,500-3,000 words)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>QI, HSR. Official publication of the National Association for Healthcare Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality in primary care <a href="http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/rmp/qpc">http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/rmp/qpc</a></td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>OR,E,R,SR,L,C (3,000 words)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>QI, clinical governance or clinical audit related to primary and prehospital care</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Other Journals:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal Title</th>
<th>Version</th>
<th>IF</th>
<th>Type papers</th>
<th>Fee</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education for Health. Change in Learning &amp; Practice</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>OR, R,L,C</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Open access journal, focused in education and HSR in communities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="http://www.educationforhealth.net/home/defaultnew.asp">http://www.educationforhealth.net/home/defaultnew.asp</a></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(2500 words)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Education Online <a href="http://med-ed-online.net/index.php/meo">http://med-ed-online.net/index.php/meo</a></td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>OR,R,T,C,L</td>
<td>$600</td>
<td>Focused in medical education, open to QI teaching and innovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postgraduate Medical Journal <a href="http://pmj.bmj.com/site/about/">http://pmj.bmj.com/site/about/</a></td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>OR,R,L,IA</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Opportunity to publish many types of articles including quality improvement reports.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(3500 words)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### "Clinical" journals:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal Title</th>
<th>Version</th>
<th>IF</th>
<th>Type papers</th>
<th>Fee</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Journal of General Internal Medicine <a href="http://www.springer.com/medicine/internal/journal/11606">http://www.springer.com/medicine/internal/journal/11606</a></td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>OR,R,L,C (OR 3000 words)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Curriculum development and QI studies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Note 1: N Engl J Med, Lancet, BMJ, JAMA, Ann Intern Med are open to publish QI studies
Note 2: P: Print; E: electronic; OR: original research; E: editorial; R: review; L: letter; C:comments. IF=Impact Factor (2009)
Note 3: Publication fee: Author Fee to publish in open access journals

Prepared by Adolfo Pena, MD. [adolfoinquiry@yahoo.com](mailto:adolfoinquiry@yahoo.com) Birmingham VA Medical Center
VA National Quality Scholars Program ([www.vaqs.org](http://www.vaqs.org)). The University of Alabama at Birmingham
Updated 01/14/11.