

HOW TO BE A REVIEWER FOR HOSPITAL MEDICINE ARTICLES – THE SQUIRE GUIDELINES

- Ben Taylor, MD, MPH. The University of Alabama at Birmingham bbtaylor@uab.edu
- Amir Jaffer, MD. University of Miami. ajaffer@med.miami.edu
- William Southern, MD. Moses Division Hospital of Montefiore Medical Center. wsouther@montefiore.org
- Jean S. Kutner, MD, MSPH. University of Colorado Denver School of Medicine Jean.Kutner@ucdenver.edu
- Carlos Estrada, MD, MS. Birmingham VA National Quality Scholars Program, Birmingham VAMC, The University of Alabama at Birmingham (Carlos.Estrada@va.gov).

In conjunction with: Academic Hospitalist Taskforce

Summary

SHM Editors and a past JGIM Deputy Editor will highlight the benefits of participating as a journal reviewer and provide specific suggestions about how to become an effective reviewer. The interactive workshop will be helpful to prospective, new, and experienced reviewers (residents, fellows, and faculty are invited to participate). An effective review discusses the importance and originality of the study, identifies the strengths and weaknesses, provides specific and constructive suggestions supplying examples from the manuscript, and comments on the interpretation of the results. Discussants will focus on quality and safety studies using the Standards for Quality Improvement Reporting Excellence (SQUIRE) guidelines for publication of quality improvement articles <http://squire-statement.org>. We will provide an annotated list of journal venues and resources for hospitalists with an interest in quality and safety improvement.

Online Preliminary Program Summary:

Presenters will highlight the benefits of participating as a reviewer and provide specific suggestions about how to become an effective reviewer. The interactive workshop will be helpful to prospective, new, and experienced reviewers (residents, fellows, and faculty are invited to participate). An effective review discusses the importance and originality of the study, identifies the strengths and weaknesses, provides specific and constructive suggestions supplying examples from the manuscript, and comments on the interpretation of the results. Discussants will focus on quality and safety studies using the Standards for Quality Improvement Reporting Excellence (SQUIRE) guidelines for publication of quality improvement articles <http://squire-statement.org>. We will provide an annotated list of journal venues and resources for hospitalists with an interest in quality and safety improvement.

Learning Objectives:

(1) List features of an effective reviewer of hospital medicine manuscripts, (2) List strategies for preparing outstanding reviews, (3) Increase awareness of the SQUIRE guidelines.

Agenda:

- Introduction, Goals, and Objectives (5 min).
- Presentation. Overview of the review process, reviewer responsibilities, benefits, and characteristics of a good review. We will illustrate key points with a concise presentation (10 min).
- Small Group Exercise. Participants will work in small groups to identify the salient features of more and less effective reviews using samples from reviews of recent hospital medicine-related articles (30 min).
- Discussion and Summary. Groups will briefly present their main findings. Faculty will present the SQUIRE guidelines in parallel to emphasize specific areas while addressing questions from the audience (35 min)
- Conclusions. Participants will receive a list of journals to sign up to become a reviewer (5 min).
- Evaluation (5 min).

What Do We Know About Reviews?

- Quality of peer reviews vary widely
J Gen Intern Med 1993;8:422-8.
- Improves
 - Precision of reporting, results, discussion, temper conclusions
 - Manuscript in general, abstract quality, readability, accuracy of references (technical editing)
Ann Intern Med 1994;121:11-21. JAMA 1994;272:119-21. 2002;287:2821-4.
- Better quality reviews
 - Younger, lower academic rank
 - Strong academic institutions
 - Previous research training
 - Postgraduate degrees
 - Known to the editors
J Gen Intern Med 1993;8:422-8. JAMA 1998;280:231-3.
- No benefit:
 - Blinding the review process
 - Training/ feedback to reviewers
JAMA 1998;280:234-7. 1998;280:237-40. 1998;280:240-2. JAMA 2002;287:2781-3.
Ann Emerg Med 1998;32:318-22. BMJ 2004;328:673 Epub 2004 Mar 2.

Why Should I Become a Reviewer?

Sharpen your skills:

- Quality/ safety is gaining MORE prominence
- Developing programs to DECREASE re-admissions is critical
- Documenting ROI (by measuring and reporting) will garner support

Indicator of national prominence (promotion / advancement):

- Can I get a (better) job?
- Can document in Quality Portfolio <http://www.sgim.org/index.cfm?pageId=846>

TIPS: What Makes a Good Review?

Questions to think about:

- Is the paper a useful original contribution? (important? original?)
- Is the paper appropriate for the audience?
- Is the literature review current and does it place the study in appropriate context?
- Are there any ethical issues that need to be addressed?
- Are the methods and analysis valid and clear? strengths/ weaknesses?
- Are the tables and figures clear? Is there good use of space in the tables?
- Are the conclusions valid?
- Is the discussion insightful?
- Are the limitations discussed in enough detail?
- What are the relevance and implications of the findings?
- Is the writing clear and concise?



Do's

- Prioritize and organize your concerns
- Be concise, specific and give examples from the manuscript
- Provide specific and constructive suggestions
- Be respectful of the authors
- Act as the expert
- Use guidelines or checklists as appropriate
- Follow the instructions, complete promptly
- Be frank when making confidential comments to the editor
- If confidential comment to Editor, convey same message
- Declare any potential conflicts of interest
- Treat the manuscript as a confidential document

Ann Intern Med 2003;139:1038-40.

J Clin Epidemiol 1999;52:625-9. J Gen Intern Med 2006;21:281-4

WAME, World Association of Medical Editors <http://www.wame.org/resources/editor-s-syllabus#reviewers>

Bottom Line !

- Ask a colleague: "If someone sends a manuscript your way, I'd like to help!"
- Submit an article to a QI/ safety Journal (see list)
- Sign-up to be a reviewer: <http://jgim.iusm.iu.edu/>

References

SQUIRE Guidelines (Standards for Quality Improvement Reporting Excellence) Final revision – 4-29-08
http://squire-statement.org/assets/pdfs/SQUIRE_guidelines_table.pdf

Checklists

1. Davidoff D, Batalden P, Stevens D, Ogrinc D, Mooney S. Publication guidelines for quality improvement in health care: evolution of the SQUIRE project. *Qual Saf Health Care* 2008;17:i3-i9.
http://qualitysafety.bmj.com/content/17/Suppl_1/i3.full
2. Ogrinc G, Mooney S, Estrada C et al. The SQUIRE (Standards for Quality Improvement Reporting Excellence) guidelines for quality improvement reporting: explanation and elaboration. *Qual Saf Health Care* 2008;17:i13-i32 http://qualitysafety.bmj.com/content/17/Suppl_1/i13.full
3. Standards for Quality Improvement Reporting Excellence (SQUIRE) guidelines for publication of quality improvement articles <http://squire-statement.org>.
4. Non-randomized interventions. Des Jarlais DC, Lyles C, Crepaz N. Improving the reporting quality of nonrandomized evaluations of behavioral and public health interventions: the TREND statement. *Am J Public Health* 2004;94:361-6. <http://www.cdc.gov/trendstatement/> Dec 12, 2010.

General Information

5. Estrada CA, Adina Kalet A, Smith W, Chin MH. How to be an Outstanding Reviewer for the Journal of General Internal Medicine...and other Journals. *J Gen Intern Med* 2006;21:281-4.
<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1828092/>
6. HOW TO BE AN OUTSTANDING REVIEWER FOR JGIM AND OTHER JOURNALS!
<http://www.sгим.org/userfiles/file/AMHandouts/AM06/handouts/WD07.pdf>
7. World Association of Medical Editors A Syllabus for Prospective and Newly Appointed Editors. Available at: <http://www.wame.org/syllabus.htm#reviewers>. Dec 12, 2010.
8. Training package for BMJ peer reviewers. British Medical Journal.
<http://resources.bmj.com/bmj/reviewers/training-materials> Dec 12, 2010.
9. Kravitz RL, Franks P, Feldman MD, Gerrity M, Byrne C, Tierney WM. Editorial peer reviewers' recommendations at a general medical journal: are they reliable and do editors care? *PLoS One*. 2010; 5(4):e10072. <http://www.plosone.org/article/info%3Adoi%2F10.1371%2Fjournal.pone.0010072>
10. M Eccles, J Grimshaw, M Campbell, C Ramsay. Research designs for studies evaluating the effectiveness of change and improvement strategies. *Qual Saf Health Care* 2003;12:47-52.
<http://qualitysafety.bmj.com/content/12/1/47.full.html>

Venues for Safety and Quality Improvement Publications (Medline indexed)

Journal Title	Version	IF	Type papers	Fee	Comments
American journal of medical quality : http://ajm.sagepub.com/	P/E	1.4	OR,E, C,P (3,500 words)	-	Focused in the resources, processes, and perspectives contributing to health care services.
BMJ quality & safety in health care (formerly: Quality & safety in health care) http://qualitysafety.bmj.com/	P/E	2.8	OR (,2000 words),SR,R,L	-	Leading international journal.
Health and quality of life outcomes http://www.hqlo.com/	E	3.2	OR,E,R,SR,L, C	\$1,820	Focusing on the development and clinical application of patient reported outcomes
Healthcare benchmarks and quality improvement	P		E,R,SR,L,C	-	Health services research.
Implementation Science http://www.implementationscience.com/	E	2.5	OR, R	\$1,945	
International journal for quality in health care http://intqhc.oxfordjournals.org/	P/E	1.6	OR,E,R,L,C (3,500 words)	-	QI, HSR, qualitative, quantitative studies
International journal of health care quality assurance http://info.emeraldinsight.com/products/journals/journals.htm?PHPSESSID=m91hkpg0n28u0ot1fvi11230h0&id=ijhcqa	P/E	NA	OR,E,R,L,C (3,500-6000 words)	-	QI, HSR, qualitative, quantitative studies
Joint Commission journal on quality and patient safety http://www.jcrinc.com/The-Joint-Commission-Journal-on-Quality-and-Patient-Safety/	P/E	1.4	OR,E,R,L,C (2,000-4,000 words)	-	QI, leadership, HSR, Root analysis, case studies
Journal of Evaluation in Clinical Practice http://www.blackwellpublishing.com/journal.asp?ref=1356-1294	P/E	1.5	OR (5,000 words)	-	Online open optional (US \$3,000)
Journal of Graduate Medical Education http://www.jgme.org/loi/jgme	P/E		OR,R,L,C (3500 words)	-	Launched in 2009 by ACGME, calling for papers, focused in education, QI and education innovation
Journal of nursing administration http://journals.lww.com/jonajournal/pages/default.aspx	P/E	1.2	OR (3,600 words)	-	Content is geared to nurse leaders and managers.
Journal of nursing care quality http://journals.lww.com/jncqjournal/pages/default.aspx	P/E		OR,R,C (18pages)	-	Patient safety, leadership, QI, and the application of quality principles in the clinical setting
Journal for healthcare quality : http://www3.interscience.wiley.com/journal/122585946/group/home/home.html	P	1.6	OR,E,R,L,C (1,500-,3000 words)	-	QI, HSR. Official publication of the National Association for Healthcare Quality
Quality management in health care http://journals.lww.com/qmhcjournal/pages/default.aspx	P/E	NA	OR,E,R, L	-	HSR, Quality, Management. Call for papers 2010.
Quality in primary care http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/rmp/qpc	P/E	NA	OR,E,R,SR,L, C (3,000 words)	-	QI, clinical governance or clinical audit related to primary and prehospital care

Journal Title	Version	IF	Type papers	Fee	Comments
Other Journals:					
Education for Health. Change in Learning & Practice http://www.educationforhealth.net/home/defaultnew.asp	E		OR, R,L,C (2500 words)	-	Open access journal, focused in education and HSR in communities.
Medical Education Online http://med-ed-online.net/index.php/meo	E		OR,R,T,C,L (5000 words)	\$600	Focused in medical education, open to QI teaching and innovation
Postgraduate Medical Journal http://pmj.bmj.com/site/about/	P/E	1.6	OR,R,L,IA (3500 words)	-	Opportunity to publish many types of articles including quality improvement reports.
"Clinical" journals:					
American Journal of Medicine http://www.amjmed.com/	P/E	5.1	OR,R,L,C (OR 3000 words)	-	Clinical Effectiveness: Focus on 1 quality control challenge and solutions (1200 words)
Family Medicine Journal http://www.stfm.org/fmhub/	P/E	1.9	OR,R,L,C (OR 3500 words)	-	QI and medical education related papers
Journal of General Internal Medicine http://www.springer.com/medicine/internal/journal/11606	P/E	2.7	OR,R,L,C (OR 3000 words)	-	Curriculum development and QI studies
Journal of Family Practice http://www.jfponline.com/	P/E	1.6	OR,R,L,C (OR 3000 words)	-	QI related papers

Note 1: N Engl J Med, Lancet, BMJ, JAMA, Ann Intern Med are open to publish QI studies

Note 2: P: Print; E: electronic; OR: original research; E: editorial; R: review; L: letter; C: comments. IF=Impact Factor (2009)

Note 3: Publication fee: Author Fee to publish in open access journals

Prepared by Adolfo Pena, MD. adolfoinquiry@yahoo.com Birmingham VA Medical Center
VA National Quality Scholars Program (www.vaqs.org). The University of Alabama at Birmingham
Updated 01/14/11.